Building and Destroying Continental Mantle

Cin-Ty A. Lee, Peter Luffi, and Emily J. Chin

Department of Earth Sciences, Rice University, Houston, Texas 77005; email: ctle@rice.edu

Keywords

craton, peridotite, eclogite, tectosphere, boundary layer, geochemistry

Abstract

Continents, especially their Archean cores, are underlain by thick thermal boundary layers that have been largely isolated from the convecting mantle over billion-year timescales, far exceeding the life span of oceanic thermal boundary layers. This longevity is promoted by the fact that continents are underlain by highly melt-depleted peridotites, which result in a chemically distinct boundary layer that is intrinsically buoyant and strong (owing to dehydration). This chemical boundary layer counteracts the destabilizing effect of the cold thermal state of continents. The compositions of cratonic peridotites require formation at shallower depths than they currently reside, suggesting that the building blocks of continents formed in oceanic or arc environments and became “continental” after significant thickening or underthrusting. Continents are difficult to destroy, but refertilization and rehydration of continental mantle by the passage of melts can nullify the unique stabilizing composition of continents.
INTRODUCTION

Ocean basins are the surface expression of solid-state mantle convection with a mobile lid. Heat transfer in Earth’s deep interior is driven by thermally buoyant upwellings, but when the upwelling reaches the surface of Earth, the mechanism of vertical heat transfer becomes dominated by conduction, and a cold upper thermal boundary layer is generated. Progressive cooling makes this thermal boundary layer thicken and contract, causing it to eventually downwell in the form of a subducting slab. Continents, however, are underlain by much thicker and hence cooler thermal boundary layers, but unlike ocean basins, they have survived for billions of years, far longer than the ~200-Ma life span of ocean basins. This apparent paradox can be resolved if the negative thermal buoyancies of continents are compensated by intrinsic chemical buoyancy. Motivated by the lack of free-air gravity anomalies over continents (implying that continents are in isostatic equilibrium), Jordan proposed the isopycnic (iso = equal, pycnic = density) hypothesis: Continental mantle is made up of low-density, melt-depleted peridotite residua, whose low densities exactly offset the effect of thermal contraction associated with a growing thermal boundary layer (Jordan 1978, 1988). In Jordan’s view, this chemical boundary layer would equate with the thermal boundary layer; he referred to this concept as the tectosphere.

To first order, Jordan’s hypothesis has proven correct, but important questions remain. Net neutral buoyancy or isostatic equilibrium alone may not ensure stability. Specifically, if at any moment perfectly isopycnic conditions are not met, lateral pressure gradients will drive (upward) gravitational collapse of continental thermal boundary layers. The longevity of continental mantle demands an intrinsically stronger (more viscous) mantle, which effectively renders continents as rigid boundary layers physically isolated from the convecting mantle (Cooper et al. 2004, Hirth & Kohlstedt 1996, Lee et al. 2005, Lenardic et al. 2003). One widely accepted hypothesis is that continental mantle is composed of melt-depleted and dehydrated peridotites, making such mantle considerably more viscous than the “wetter,” convecting mantle (Hirth & Kohlstedt 1996, Pollack 1986). As we discuss below, this melt-depleted chemical boundary layer would coincidentally correspond to a rheological boundary layer.

Because the composition of continental mantle appears to play such an important role in its dynamic evolution, understanding how such mantle forms is important. Excellent reviews on the nature and origin of continental mantle, each from the perspective of a different field (e.g., petrology/geochemistry, geodynamics, and geophysics), already exist (Arndt et al. 2009, Canil 2008, Eaton et al. 2009, Griffin et al. 2003, King 2005, Lee 2006, Lee et al. 2005, Lenardic et al. 2003, Pearson et al. 2003, Pearson & Wittig 2008, Simon et al. 2007, Sleep 2004). We build on this foundation by providing a perspective that integrates petrology, geochemistry, and geophysics to improve our understanding of the petrogenetic and tectonic processes involved in forming continental mantle. By establishing the necessary conditions for stabilizing continental mantle, we also discuss what processes may be responsible for its chemical modification and destruction.

TERMINOLOGY

A few definitions are in order. Lithosphere denotes the mechanically strong layer that effectively acts like a rigid plate. The term is often improperly used to describe a geochemically enriched layer or the seismic lid. To avoid confusion, we use the generic term boundary layer to describe the region of the uppermost mantle where a particular physical or chemical property changes. The upper thermal boundary layer (as opposed to the lower thermal boundary layer, which would be located at the core-mantle boundary) is the uppermost part of Earth, wherein the thermal state is approximated by conductive cooling rather than by an adiabatic gradient. Its thickness

60  Lee • Luffi • Chiu
is defined by the limit at which the cooler temperatures of the boundary layer can be resolved from the mantle adiabat (which is pinned to the potential temperature of the mantle, i.e., the temperature of the convecting mantle if it were adiabatically decompressed to the surface of Earth in the solid state). Mantle viscosity increases exponentially with decreasing temperature; hence a rheological boundary layer always exists within a thermal boundary layer. Here, we equate this visously defined rheological boundary layer with the lithosphere (the viscous boundary layer is thicker than the effective elastic thickness). The region of low viscosity below the lithosphere is the asthenosphere (for additional discussion, see Eaton et al. 2009). Any chemically distinct layer in the uppermost mantle is referred to as a chemical boundary layer, which includes the crust and the part of the continental mantle that is compositionally distinct (for example, melt-depleted) from the convecting mantle. The term continental mantle is used when no particular type of boundary layer is specified. In general, the thermal, rheological, and chemical boundary layers need not coincide, but under continents, all these boundary layers may coincide.

**AGE DISTRIBUTION OF CONTINENTS**

The interiors of continents are cored by cratons (*kratos* is Greek for strength), regions of crustal basement that have not been deformed for >∼1 Ga. Thus, cratons include Archean and Proterozoic basements (see Goodwin 1991 and Hoffman 1989). Figure 1 shows the distribution of Precambrian (>540 Ma) cratons, including platforms overlain by sediments. Cratons can be further subdivided by age: Archean (>2.5 Ga) cratons are known as Archons, and Proterozoic cratons are known as Protons (Griffin et al. 2003). Surrounding Archons and Protons are Phanerozoic accreted terranes and orogenic belts, often referred to as tectons. Unlike cratons, the latter have been subjected to Phanerozoic tectonic deformation. Notably, not all Precambrian basements are immune to tectonic deformation. For example, early to mid-Proterozoic lithosphere in the southwestern United States has been influenced by Cenozoic Basin and Range extension (Lee et al. 2001), and the Archean North China and Wyoming cratons appear to have been recently thinned (Gao et al. 2002, Griffin et al. 1998, Menzies et al. 1993, Menzies et al. 2007).

The age distribution (Figure 2) of the crust is multimodal, which suggests episodicity in continent formation or destruction. Histograms of U-Pb zircon ages show peaks at 3, 2.7, 2.1, 1.7–1.8, and 1.1 Ga (Condie et al. 2009, Hawkesworth & Kemp 2006). Most of these zircon U-Pb age peaks correspond to Lu-Hf and Sm-Nd depleted-mantle model ages, so to first order, these age peaks reflect juvenile crust production (Bennett et al. 1993, Condie et al. 2009, Hawkesworth & Kemp 2006). Determining the formation age of the underlying continental mantle is more challenging because mantle xenoliths, before entrainment in the host magma, typically reside at temperatures above the closure temperature of most radiometric systems; hence their internal isochron ages often reflect eruption ages. Isotopic memory of older events is more likely preserved in whole rocks or mineral inclusions in diamonds. For example, radiogenic and unradiogenic whole-rock Sr and Nd isotopes, respectively, indicate Ga isolation in an incompatible-element-enriched environment (Cohen et al. 1984, Roden & Murthy 1985). Similarly, Nd model ages of garnet grains isolated in diamonds give Archean ages (Richardson et al. 1984). However, because Sr and Nd isotopes are incompatible elements, model ages based on these isotopic systems usually date only metamorphic events.

Better constraints on the timing of melt extraction and initial isolation from the convecting mantle are obtained from the Re-Os isotopic system (Chesley et al. 1999; Handler et al. 1997; Pearson et al. 1995a, b; Reisberg & Lorand 1995; Shirey & Walker 1998; Walker et al. 1989). In this isotopic system, the parent isotope $^{187}$Re is incompatible in the solid during melting, but the daughter isotope $^{187}$Os is compatible. Therefore, with extreme melt depletion, the residue
“freezes” in the original $^{187}\text{Os}/^{188}\text{Os}$ of the rock, which can be used to calculate a model age for separation from the convecting mantle. The compatibility of Os also ensures that most metasomatizing agents (melts or fluids) are highly depleted in Os; hence disturbance by metasomatism is minimal. Although some complications arise from Re and platinum-group-element metasomatism (Alard et al. 2000), broad conclusions based on Re-Os model ages can be made. Whole-rock Re-Os model ages give peaks at 2.7 ± 0.3 Ga and between 1.0 and 2.0 Ga (see Carlson et al. 2005). More recently, Os isotopic measurements have been made on sulfides in peridotites and in diamond inclusions, yielding similar results (Alard et al. 2002, Pearson & Wittig 2008, Shirey et al. 2002). In summary, both continental crust and mantle formation appear to be episodic and coeval to within error (Figure 2).

THICKNESS OF CONTINENTS

Constraints from Surface Heat Flux

One of the first constraints on the thickness of continents came from surface heat flux measurements, which were used to extrapolate surface temperatures to depth assuming a
steady-state conductive geotherm (Pollack et al. 1993). The intersection of this conductive geotherm with the mantle adiabat is equated with the base of the thermal boundary layer (Figure 3). Surface heat flux is generally low (30–40 mW m\(^{-2}\)) in Archean cratons, high (>60–80 mW m\(^{-2}\)) in most Phanerozoic regions, and low to intermediate in Proterozoic regions (Nyblade 1999, Pollack et al. 1993). Although some of this variation could arise from variations in

---

**Figure 3**

radioactive heat production of the crust, most of the variation is attributed to thermal boundary layer thickness. Thickness has been estimated to be ~200–250 km beneath cratons and <100 km beneath Phanerozoic terranes (Nyblade 1999, Pollack et al. 1993), although thicknesses exceeding 300 km have also been suggested (Artemieva & Mooney 2001). However, these thickness estimates come with large uncertainties because the assumption of steady state may not be valid, the “measured” surface heat flux may be in error (due to transient effects or to advective components), and the distribution of heat-producing elements in the lithosphere is poorly constrained.

Constraints from Xenolith Geotherms

Mantle xenoliths provide a direct and model-independent approach in constraining the thermal state of continental thermal boundary layers (Boyd 1987, Rudnick et al. 1998). Because of their rapid ascent rates, their high-pressure and high-temperature equilibrium states are kinetically “frozen in” and preserved in the compositions of the minerals. A variety of thermobarometer pairs have been used to give consistent xenolith geotherms (Brey & Kohler 1990, Ellis & Green 1979, Harley & Green 1982). Xenolith P-T data (Figure 3) from the Archean Kaapvaal, Slave, and Siberian cratons define geotherms that intersect the 1,300–1,400°C mantle adiabat at depths between 200 and 250 km. The deepest and hottest xenoliths have historically been referred to as the high-temperature sheared peridotites (see Petrology and Geochemistry of Continental Mantle, below). Xenoliths from the edge of the Archean Tanzanian craton near the active East African Rift fall on a slightly hotter geotherm and limit the local thermal boundary layer to ~150 km (Lee & Rudnick 1999, Rudnick et al. 1994). Proterozoic cratons, such as the Colorado Plateau craton in southwestern North America, also yield thermal boundary layer thicknesses of ~150 km (Smith 2000). Peridotite xenoliths sampled in Phanerozoic terranes are mostly garnet free, so accurate constraints on their pressure cannot be obtained. Nevertheless, the absence of garnet is consistent with lithosphere thicknesses in Phanerozoic terranes that are less than ~60–80 km (depending on the Cr content of spinel; see O’Neill 1981). The thin lithosphere beneath Phanerozoic terranes is corroborated by the depths of magma generation as inferred from the silica activity of the basaltic lavas that host the xenoliths in these regions (Lee et al. 2009).

Seismic Constraints

Seismic constraints on boundary layer thicknesses give different results depending on the method. Body-wave seismic tomography commonly shows high-velocity anomalies beneath cratons extending to depths beyond 300 km, sometimes as deep as 400 km. These results have long been known to be inconsistent with xenolith geotherms. However, because of the relatively vertical paths of body waves used in tomographic studies, vertical resolution is poor and uncertainties in lithosphere thickness are large.

Surface wave studies provide better depth resolution than body waves in the upper mantle and show that continents are defined by a seismically fast lid underlain by a low-velocity layer, often interpreted to equate with a rheologically weak asthenosphere (Cammarano & Romanowicz 2007, Dalton et al. 2009, Nettles & Dziewonski 2008). Ocean basins have thinner lids (~100 km) than the old cores of continents (~200–250 km). In particular, surface wave anisotropy studies show that cratons are underlain by a layer of radial anisotropy, where horizontally polarized shear waves are faster than vertically polarized shear waves in the depth range of 250–400 km (Gung et al. 2003). This finding suggests that at depths greater than ~250 km, there lies a low-viscosity shear zone (asthenosphere) characterized by lattice-preferred orientation of olivine. Global seismic
attenuation studies based on surface waves also indicate a change in seismic character deeper than ∼200 km (Dalton et al. 2009).

Receiver function studies using Sp and Ps converted phases also help constrain lithosphere thicknesses because such conversions are sensitive to sharp subhorizontal velocity transitions (Fischer et al. 2010). For example, Niu et al. (2004) used Ps converted waves to show that the “410”-km discontinuity beneath the Kaapvaal craton was not perturbed. This result, combined with geodynamic constraints on thermal boundary layer thicknesses permitted by a rigid chemical boundary layer, provides an upper bound of <300 km for the thickness of cratons (Cooper et al. 2004). More detailed studies of Sp and Ps conversions within the uppermost mantle are more difficult to interpret (Rychert & Shearer 2009). Sharp velocity gradients occur in Phanerozoic continental regions at depths of <100 km (Rychert & Shearer 2009), consistent with estimates of thermal boundary layer thickness based on surface heat flux, xenolith thermobarometry, and magma thermobarometry (Lee et al. 2009, Luffi et al. 2009, Smith 2000). Beneath cratons, however, Ps and Sp conversions occur at a depth of ∼90 km, well within the thermal boundary layer (Rychert & Shearer 2009). The origin of these internal discontinuities is unknown, but dipping structures have been observed in numerous cratons and have been interpreted to represent imbricated oceanic lithosphere or fossilized sutures (Bostock 1999, Hansen & Dueker 2009). Finally, no strong Ps or Sp conversions are seen at the expected base of cratonic thermal boundary layers (see Fischer et al. 2010 for a review). Surface wave studies also do not show universal evidence for the presence of a low-velocity layer beneath cratons (Pedersen et al. 2009). The low-velocity zone beneath cratons may be subtle or even nonexistent, raising the possibility that the low-viscosity layer (e.g., asthenosphere) is very thin beneath continents.

PETROLOGY AND GEOCHEMISTRY OF CONTINENTAL MANTLE

This section discusses the major- and minor-element chemistry of continental mantle as constrained from xenoliths because these elements control the physical properties of rocks and their petrogenetic origin. Detailed summaries of the petrology and of the trace-element and isotope geochemistry of continental mantle rocks can be found elsewhere in the literature (Canil 2004, Griffin et al. 2003, Griffin et al. 1999, Pearson et al. 2003, Pearson & Wittig 2008, Simon et al. 2007).

Peridotites

Peridotites as residues of melt extraction. Peridotites dominate in continental mantle and consist of olivine, orthopyroxene, clinopyroxene, and an aluminous phase, such as spinel at low pressure and garnet at high pressure (>∼2–3 GPa). Owing to differences in continental lithosphere thickness, spinel peridotites and garnet peridotites dominate Phanerozoic mantle and cratonic mantle, respectively. Continental peridotites range from fertile (rich in basaltic melt components) lithologies, akin to “primitive mantle” or pyrolite, to highly melt-depleted lithologies (Boyd 1987, Boyd 1989, Boyd & Mertzman 1987). The former are lherzolitic in composition and characterized by high clinopyroxene mode (10–20%) and high Al₂O₃, CaO, and Na₂O content. The latter are harzburgitic (olivine and orthopyroxene) and characterized by low Al₂O₃, CaO, and Na₂O and high MgO content.

Figure 4 shows that Al₂O₃ and Na₂O content of Phanerozoic, Proterozoic, and Archean peridotites are negatively correlated with MgO. Because progressive melt extraction results in the depletion of clinopyroxene and garnet, leaving behind an olivine- and orthopyroxene-rich residue, such trends can be broadly explained in terms of melt depletion. Melt depletion also results in
an increase in olivine/orthopyroxene ratio and atomic Mg# in the residual peridotite [Mg# = atomic Mg/(Mg + FeT), where FeT corresponds to total Fe content]. This occurs because liquids in equilibrium with peridotites have higher SiO₂, lower MgO, and lower Mg#. Using Mg/Si as a proxy for olivine mode (atomic Mg/Si ∼ 2) and orthopyroxene mode (atomic Mg/Si ∼ 1) shows that Mg/Si and Mg# correlate, as predicted from experimental studies on peridotite melting (Figure 5). Interpreted in terms of melt depletion, the high Mg/Si and Mg# of many of the Archean peridotites require high degrees of melt extraction compared with Phanerozoic peridotites, which have lower Mg/Si and Mg#. Figure 6 shows histograms of Mg# for different peridotite suites, ranging from Archean cratons to Phanerozoic xenoliths and obducted ophiolites. Although there are no fundamental differences between Archean and Phanerozoic peridotites in terms of element covariation trends, Archean peridotites consistently have higher Mg# than Proterozoic and Phanerozoic peridotites. These differences have been interpreted to reflect secular changes in the average degree of melting associated with the formation of continental mantle (Griffin et al. 2003).

Modal metasomatism and refertilization of peridotites. Major-element systematics, however, cannot be interpreted solely in terms of melt depletion. First, a small group of peridotites, represented primarily by Archean peridotites from the Kaapvaal craton in South Africa, have excess orthopyroxene for a given Mg# and thus deviate from the melt depletion trend toward low Mg/Si shown in Figure 5 (Boyd 1989). Suggestions for this excess orthopyroxene have included melt-rock reaction between peridotite and silicic melts generated by partial melting of subducting oceanic crust (Boyd 1989, Rudnick et al. 1994, Simon et al. 2007), metasomatism by Si-rich aqueous fluids (Bernstein et al. 1998, Kelemen et al. 1998, Simon et al. 2007, Smith et al. 2008).
Figure 5
Atomic Mg/Si versus atomic Mg/(Mg + FeT) (also known as Mg#) for peridotites. The large positively sloping arrow represents a trend of melt depletion as constrained by experimental melting of fertile peridotite. With increasing melt depletion, the residue increases in Mg/(Mg + FeT) and olivine mode (high Mg/Si). Deviations from this trend toward high Si (low Mg/Si) indicate orthopyroxene enrichment (vertical, downward pointing arrow).

Figure 6
Relative probability histograms for whole-rock atomic Mg/(Mg + FeT) for peridotites from (a) Archean and Proterozoic terranes and (b) Phanerozoic terranes. Vertical shaded bar represents primitive-mantle value.
addition of orthopyroxene-rich cumulates generated from high-pressure magmas (>7 GPa) (Herzberg 1993), physical segregation of olivine and orthopyroxene during metamorphism (Boyd 1989), and inheritance from serpentinized protoliths (Canil & Lee 2009).

A more serious complication concerns peridotites that have been refertilized (i.e., re-enriched in basaltic melt components) but that adhere to apparent melt-depletion trends in terms of major elements. For example, the negative correlation between Na$_2$O and MgO appears roughly consistent with melt depletion. However, because Na$_2$O is incompatible in the residue and MgO is compatible in the residue, melt depletion results in nonlinear trends arising from the efficient extraction of Na$_2$O (Figure 4b; see Elthon 1992, Luffi et al. 2009). The observed linear Na$_2$O-MgO trends thus suggest binary mixing between two components, a highly melt-depleted peridotite, and a basaltic melt (see also Ionov et al. 2005 and Le Roux et al. 2007). Interestingly, many of the most fertile lithologies are found at the base of the continental lithosphere and have been referred to as the high-temperature sheared peridotites because of their commonly mylonitic fabrics (Boyd 1987). Some of these fertile lithologies preserve ancient unradiogenic $^{187}$Os/$^{188}$Os isotopic compositions, suggesting that refertilization was relatively recent (Carlson et al. 2005, Pearson et al. 1995a).

**Temperatures, pressures, and extent of melt extraction.** The above observations indicate that continental mantle is the product of at least two major processes: melt depletion followed by refertilization or other major metasomatic enrichment processes (e.g., Si enrichment). Of interest are the pressures and temperatures over which melt depletion occurred. These quantities have been estimated from comparisons of major-element compositions with partial melting experiments of fertile peridotites. More sophisticated, model-dependent approaches have considered decompression melting; details can be found in Herzberg (2004) and Walter (1999, 2003). A simple and less model-dependent approach is to examine the covariation of FeO and MgO in peridotites (Figure 7). FeO in peridotites and coexisting liquids is often used as a pressure indicator, but Fe partitioning is actually significantly more sensitive to temperature than to pressure. The correlation between pressure and Fe in peridotites and liquids is the fortuitous consequence of the peridotite solidus having a positive Clapeyron slope, i.e., $dP/dT > 0$. A simultaneous examination of FeO and MgO can determine the average temperature and degree of melting, $F$, on the basis of a combination of mass balance and the equilibrium relationships of Fe-Mg exchange between peridotite and melt; this process follows the approach of Hanson & Langmuir (1978) (see also Pearson et al. 1995a). As seen from the perspective of the peridotite residue (Figure 7), high $F$ is reflected in high Mg# and high MgO, whereas high temperature is reflected in terms of low FeO$_T$. Although secondary re-enrichment processes complicate the interpretation of FeO and MgO, all samples identified as Si enriched using the Mg/Si–Mg# plot (Figure 5) define a distinctive low-FeO field and are excluded from discussion. Identifying basalt-refertilized peridotites is not as straightforward, but peridotites with Mg# > 0.92 may be close to pristine as they do not fall on mixing arrays (Figure 7).

Archean residual peridotites with Mg# > 0.92 experienced 30–50% melt depletion (relative to a “primitive-mantle” starting composition) at average temperatures between 1,500 and 1,700°C (Figure 7), whereas Phanerzoic peridotites show melting degrees of <30% and melting temperatures between 1,300 and 1,500°C. These temperature estimates are consistent with Archean and Phanerozoic mantle potential temperatures as estimated from the major-element compositions of Archean komatiites and Phanerozoic mid-ocean ridge basalts (Herzberg et al. 2010, Lee et al. 2009). The high temperatures (up to 1,900°C) often cited for cratonic peridotites undoubtedly refer to the Si-rich peridotites, which are FeO poor and hence yield overestimated temperatures.

---

**References:**


Figure 7

Whole-rock FeO\textsubscript{T} versus MgO. Squares represent Archean cratonic peridotites: White squares represent Si-enriched peridotites that fall off the Mg/Si–Mg\# melt-depletion trend shown in Figure 5; green squares represent “normal” cratonic peridotites. Black circles represent Phanerozoic continental peridotites. Red solid lines represent isothermal melting curves (which implicitly assume a change in pressure). Red dashed lines represent melting-degree contours. Blue diagonal lines represent constant Mg\#. The white arrow shows the direction of Si enrichment; note no change in Mg\#. The green arrow shows the direction of refertilization; note the decrease in Mg\#. Calculations assume a given primitive-mantle starting composition, a mass balance for batch melting, and a coefficient of 0.32 for the Fe-Mg exchange between bulk peridotite and melt. Mg of melt is converted to temperature using an empirical relationship between MgO and temperature in olivine-saturated anhydrous melts.

Constraints on pressures can also be obtained. Melting at high pressure where garnet is stable on the solidus should yield residues with high Al\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{3} and Yb for a given level of MgO content, but cratonic peridotites follow the same trends in Al-Mg and Yb-Mg space as Phanerozoic spinel peridotites. This suggests that cratonic peridotites largely melted in the absence of garnet and thus at pressures lower (<4–5 GPa) than their present equilibration pressures (3–7 GPa) (Canil 2004, Kelemen et al. 1998, Lee 2006, Pearson & Wittig 2008, Wittig et al. 2008). This is also consistent with the high Cr content in cratonic peridotites, which requires melting in the spinel stability field because Cr is much more compatible in spinel than in garnet (Canil 2004). Counterarguments maintain that most of the melt-depletion history has been erased by refertilization and that extreme degrees of melt depletion completely remove garnet so that Yb and Al contents are no longer diagnostic of pressure (Arndt et al. 2009). However, it is difficult to argue that the high Cr content of cratonic peridotites resulted from refertilization (particularly in the garnet stability field).

Assuming melting occurs by adiabatic decompression, final pressures of melting can be estimated from the intersection of melting-degree contours and the average temperature of melting in P-T space (Figure 8). The 1,500–1,700°C and \( F = 30–50\% \) ranges mentioned above suggest that final melt extraction took place between 1 and 5 GPa. Initial pressures of melting were certainly greater but unlikely to have exceeded 7–8 GPa. Bernstein et al. (2007) argued that the near-exhaustion of orthopyroxene and high Mg\# in cratonic peridotites require final melt-extraction
pressures to be <3 GPa. Collectively, the above observations indicate that cratonic peridotites melted at low pressures (<4–5 GPa) and that afterward, they were tectonically displaced to greater pressures (up to 7–8 GPa). Their current mineralogy is the product of metamorphic reactions taking place during this transit in P-T space (Figure 8). Cox et al. (1987), Canil (1991), and Saltzer et al. (2001) also have suggested that most of the garnet in cratonic harzburgites is not magmatic but formed during subsolidus compression, either by exsolution from pyroxenes or at the expense of spinel.

Pyroxenites

Pyroxenites are the second-most abundant rocks in continental mantle (Barth et al. 2001, 2002; Beard et al. 1996; Fung & Haggerty 1995; Horodyskyj et al. 2007; Jacob 2004; Pyle & Haggerty 1998; Taylor & Neal 1989; Taylor et al. 2003). Many of these pyroxenites contain garnet and are loosely referred to as eclogites. Garnet-bearing pyroxenites also occur in some Phanerozoic peridotite suites. Because of their high densities compared with peridotites, their presence may have profound implications for the stability of continental mantle.

Cratonic garnet pyroxenites can be subdivided into high-MgO and low-MgO suites (Figure 9) (Barth et al. 2001, 2002). Although a complete spectrum exists between the two suites,
we define the demarcation to occur at 15 wt% MgO (Horodyskyj et al. 2007). High-MgO garnet pyroxenites are characterized by clinopyroxene \( \sim \) orthopyroxene \( \sim \) garnet modes, high Mg#, and high Ni and Cr content. Low-MgO garnet pyroxenites are dominated by garnet \( \geq \) clinopyroxene, generally minor amounts of orthopyroxene, low Mg#, and low Ni and Cr content. Many of the high-MgO garnet pyroxenites have major-element compositions similar to picritic basalts (high MgO and low SiO2, \(<50\) wt%), but many have SiO2 content too high (50 wt%) to represent basaltic liquids generated from anhydrous partial melting of the mantle. Most low-MgO garnet pyroxenites have major-element compositions broadly similar to modern mid-ocean ridge basalts (MORBs), although SiO2 content may be slightly lower than what is found in MORBs.

**Low-MgO garnet pyroxenites.** Hypotheses for the origin of low-MgO pyroxenites abound. Their protoliths are widely thought to be oceanic crust or gabbros because their oxygen isotopic compositions deviate by \(>1\)‰ units (Barth et al. 2001, Jacob 2004) from the canonical mantle value of \(\delta^{18}O_{MORB} = 5.5\)‰ (Mattey et al. 1994). Only low-temperature alteration is considered efficient in fractionating oxygen isotopes. For example, hydrothermal alteration results in both positive and negative oxygen isotope fractionations within the oceanic lithosphere (positive
deviations in the uppermost crust and negative deviations in the lower crust due to inheritance from $^{18}$O-depleted reactive waters; see Gregory & Taylor 1981). Archean low-MgO pyroxenites often show both positive and negative deviations; hence their protoliths may represent different sections of subducted oceanic lithosphere (see Jacob 2004 for a review). Cratonic low-MgO pyroxenites, however, are actually poorer in SiO$_2$ and Na$_2$O than Franciscan-type eclogites found in Phanerozoic accretionary wedges; pyroxenites with bona fide MORB protoliths are an example. These differences signify either that the protoliths do not actually resemble modern MORB or that their compositions have been modified by partial melt extraction (Barth et al. 2001, Rollinson 1997). Such melting would generate felsic rocks similar to the tonalite-trondhjemite-granodiorite series rocks commonly found in Archean terranes (Condie 2005, Foley et al. 2002, Rapp et al. 2003, Smithies 2000).

The aforementioned stable-isotope evidence for a low-temperature origin has been challenged on the suggestion that stable-isotope fractionation can, under some conditions (presumably during kinetically limited processes, such as melt-rock reaction), occur at high temperatures (Griffin & O’Reilly 2007). However, such processes have never been demonstrated to be efficient enough to generate $>1\%$ fractionation or to give rise to systematic correlations between stable isotopes and major lithologic types. Moreover, diamonds with eclogitic inclusions contain sulfides showing mass-independent sulfur-isotope fractionation, a feature that has been documented to occur only during photochemical reactions high in Earth’s atmosphere (Farquhar et al. 2002). In addition, diamonds with eclogitic inclusions are made of extremely light carbon, as exemplified by $\delta^{13}$C values significantly lower (approaching values of $-35\%$) than the canonical mantle value of $-5.5\%$. Such low values are generally taken to reflect a biogenic origin, but Cartigny et al. (1998) showed that diamond nitrogen isotopes do not have a biogenic signature. Although there is still room for debate, the consistency of several lines of independent observations (with the exception of N isotopes) has led to general agreement that low-MgO eclogites represent recycled oceanic crust.

High-MgO garnet pyroxenites. This suite of pyroxenites is more difficult to interpret. Their oxygen isotopic compositions are mantle-like (Barth et al. 2002). They have been interpreted to represent (a) trapped high-pressure, mantle-derived liquids, (b) the products of melt-rock reaction between basaltic liquids and peridotite, (c) subducted picritic oceanic crust, and (d) high-pressure cumulates (Barth et al. 2001, 2002). None of these scenarios is mutually exclusive, but each has different implications for the origin of continental mantle. The major-element compositions of some of these garnet pyroxenites have modern analogs as olivine-plagioclase-pyroxene gabbros in oceanic crust or olivine-rich magmas, such as Hawaiian picrites. However, most are too rich in SiO$_2$ to originate from gabbro or picrite protoliths. High-MgO pyroxenite cumulates from Phanerozoic arcs are a better match in terms of major-element and Ni and Cr content (Ducea & Saleeby 1998, Horodyskyj et al. 2007, Jagoutz et al. 2009, Lee et al. 2006). These similarities to arc-related pyroxenites suggest that it may be worth considering arc magmatism as a factor in the petrogenesis of cratons.

Cryptic Metasomatism

A pervasive feature of continental mantle peridotites is that their trace-element signatures (and time-integrated radiogenic isotopic compositions) are often overprinted by re-enrichment processes (Roden & Murthy 1985). These processes recall the refertilization and modal metasomatic processes described above, but in many cases the metasomatism is of a cryptic nature, in which trace-element signatures have been modified but the major elements and mineralogy have not
Some notable metasomatic “flavors” are highlighted here. One type is represented by similar enrichments in the high-field strength elements (e.g., Nb, Ta, Zr, Hf, and Ti) and the rare-earth elements. This signature is typical of intraplate magmas, such as alkali basalts, basanites, and ultrapotassic rocks; thus xenoliths with such signatures are often interpreted to have been infiltrated by similar liquids at depth (Dawson 1987). In some cases, enrichments in high-field strength elements are sufficient to stabilize accessory minerals, such as rutile, ilmenite, and zircon (Dawson & Smith 1977, Rudnick et al. 1999), in which case metasomatism is modal, not cryptic. Such metasomatism can also introduce hydrous minerals, such as phlogopite and amphibole, and can increase Fe oxidation state (Dawson & Smith 1977).

Another type of metasomatism is represented by depletions in high-field strength elements relative to the rare-earth elements and thought to derive from volatile-rich fluids (e.g., hydrous or carbonatitic fluids) because the solubility of these elements is much lower in fluids than in large-ion lithophile elements and light rare-earth elements (Kelemen et al. 1993). In intraplate environments, these signatures are commonly attributed to carbonatite metasomatism (Dautria et al. 1992, Ionov et al. 1993, Rudnick et al. 1993, Yaxley et al. 1991), but in some cases subduction-zone fluids may have been involved (Lee 2005).

What these trace-element-enriched peridotites hold in common is that the responsible metasomatizing agent was most likely a low-degree melt.

**INTERNAL STRUCTURE OF CONTINENTAL MANTLE**

**Compositional Stratification**

**Figure 10** plots whole-rock Mg# of peridotites as a function of equilibration depth for several Archean cratons and one Proterozoic craton. The Archean Siberian (Boyd et al. 1997), Kaapvaal (Boyd & Mertzman 1987, Boyd et al. 1993, Simon et al. 2007, Winterburn et al. 1989), and Slave (Canil 2008, Kopylova & Russell 2000, Kopylova et al. 1999) cratons show highly depleted (high-Mg#) peridotites in the upper ~150 km but more fertile lithologies at greater depths. In particular, at depths shallower than 150 km for the Siberian and Kaapvaal cratons, there is no systematic covariation of melt depletion with depth. However, in the Slave craton, peridotite fertility increases progressively with depth (Kopylova & Russell 2000). The Archean Tanzanian (Lee & Rudnick 1999, Rudnick et al. 1994) and Proterozoic Colorado Plateau (Ehrenberg 1982, Lee et al. 2001, Smith 2000) cratons show relatively restricted xenolith equilibration pressures, but this most likely arises from sampling bias of the host magmas. More curiously, the Tanzanian and Colorado Plateau xenoliths show a complete spectrum between fertile and highly melt-depleted peridotites at a given depth. A nagging question is whether xenolith demographics are representative of the mantle’s true stratigraphy, as the sampling characteristics of kimberlites and other host magmas are not well understood. To decrease sampling bias, Griffin et al. (2003) reconstructed mantle stratigraphic sections from thousands of xenocrystic peridotite minerals resulting from disaggregation of xenoliths during magmatic ascent. The whole-rock stratigraphy is broadly consistent with the Griffin et al. (2003) xenocryst results in that cratons are dominated by highly melt-depleted peridotites at depths shallower than ~150 km, but more fertile and metasomatized lithologies dominate at greater depths. On the basis of the geochemical and isotopic data discussed above, this fertile layer appears to originate from melt-depleted peridotites via refertilization rather than represent undepleted mantle.

**Density Structure**

The compositional stratigraphy has implications for the density structure of continents. Although there is no perfect parameterization of density as a function of composition, there is a general
Figure 10

Mg# [atomic Mg/(Mg + FeT)] of cratonic peridotites versus depth for (a) the Siberian craton, (b) the South African craton, (c) the Slave craton, and (d) the Tanzanian and Colorado Plateau cratons. Lines labeled isopycnic represent the hypothetical Mg# needed to make cratonic mantle compositionally buoyant enough to exactly compensate for the negative thermal buoyancy at every depth. Craton thermal states taken from xenolith geotherms in Figure 4. Conversion of Mg# to density uses parameterizations from Lee (2003).

decrease with increasing Mg# (Jordan 1979, Lee 2003, Schutt & Lesher 2006). An increase in Mg# from 0.89 to 0.93 yields a ~2% density decrease. Cratonic mantle is on average ~500–700°C cooler than the ambient mantle (~1,400°C), resulting in a ~2% increase in density due to thermal contraction. Thus density variations associated with melt depletion are of the same but opposite magnitude as thermal buoyancies. Using the density-Mg# relationship of Lee (2003), ρ = −1.44Mg# + 4.66, and the xenolith geotherms shown in Figure 4, we plot how Mg# would vary with depth if the perfectly isopycnic conditions required by the tectosphere hypothesis were met (Figure 10). Perfectly isopycnic conditions require Mg# to decrease with depth gradually (Figure 10). Such a trend is seen only in the Slave craton. Although the Kaapvaal and Siberian cratons do not show perfect isopycnic density structure, their mantles overall are neutrally buoyant to within error. Kaapvaal cratonic peridotites may even be offset by +0.01 Mg# units from isopycnic conditions. This would correspond to an excess compositional buoyancy of ~0.4%. These excess chemical buoyancies, based on peridotites alone, have previously been suggested (Kelly et al. 2003), but given the lack of free-air gravity anomalies over continents, there should be no
excess buoyancies. Kelly et al. (2003) suggested that dense garnet pyroxenites could account for the missing buoyancy. Garnet pyroxenites are 2–12% denser than peridotites (Horodyskyj et al. 2007). An excess peridotite buoyancy of 0.4%, if real, would require 3–8% of low-MgO garnet pyroxenites (5–12% denser than peridotite) or 8–20% of high-MgO garnet pyroxenites to make up the difference. Incidentally, the 3–8% of low-MgO garnet pyroxenites is broadly consistent with the proportions of low-MgO garnet pyroxenites observed in garnet xenocryst populations in kimberlites (Schulze 1989).

Garnet pyroxenites may have distinct seismic signatures. Low-MgO garnet pyroxenites have P- and S-wave velocities 1% and 1–3% higher than peridotite, respectively, which are sufficient to generate distinctive reflectors or converted phases (Horodyskyj et al. 2007, Levander et al. 2005). Dipping or subhorizontal structures of this type have been observed in the Slave, Wyoming, and possibly the Kaapvaal cratons and have been interpreted to represent the tops of fossil oceanic lithosphere (Bostock 1999). High-MgO pyroxenites, in contrast, have similar or lower P- and S-wave velocities compared with peridotites (Horodyskyj et al. 2007). Their presence could be difficult to detect seismically, but if they occur as a distinct layer within the mantle, they may generate the appearance of a localized low-velocity zone. This would perhaps provide one explanation for the origin of internal discontinuities seen by Rychert & Shearer (2009).

Water Content and Viscosity Structure

Understanding the water budget of continental mantle is important because the viscosity of olivine, which dominates the rheology of peridotite, decreases substantially in the presence of minute amounts of bound H (Hirth & Kohlstedt 1996). Because H is highly incompatible in solids during partial melting (Aubaud et al. 2008), the highly melt-depleted peridotites of cratons are expected to be dehydrated and intrinsically strong (Hirth et al. 2000, Pollack 1986). The database for H in nominally anhydrous minerals—such as olivine, clinopyroxene, and orthopyroxene—is growing, but interpretations of the data are often not straightforward (see Peslier 2010 for a comprehensive review). Because of the high diffusivity of H in these minerals, the measured H content of xenolith-hosted minerals may not be representative of the pre-eruptive state (Kohlstedt & Mackwell 1998, Mackwell & Kohlstedt 1999). A peculiar observation is that despite similar diffusivities, pyroxenes appear to retain H even if coexisting olivines show H loss (Grant et al. 2007, Li et al. 2008, Peslier 2010, Yang et al. 2008).

The pre-eruptive H content of olivines can be retrieved via the assumption of equilibration between olivine and pyroxene (Figure 11). Clinopyroxenes from Kaapvaal peridotite xenoliths have clinopyroxene H$_2$O (Grant et al. 2007, Peslier 2010) corresponding to olivine H$_2$O content (2–18 ppmw; by weight) that overlaps or falls slightly below that inferred for olivine in the MORB mantle source (~10–30 ppmw; see Hirschmann 2006). Thus these clinopyroxenes are not particularly dry compared with the convecting mantle. Calculated olivine H content from the North China craton (Yang et al. 2008) is mostly drier than MORB olivine and overlaps the low H$_2$O content of olivines in abyssal peridotite (Peslier et al. 2007), which are thought to be the melting residues of oceanic crust formation. Clinopyroxenes from the Proterozoic Colorado Plateau craton (Li et al. 2008) are the “wettest” cratonic clinopyroxenes measured so far and would correspond to olivine H$_2$O content equal to or higher than the MORB source. Phanerozoic continental mantle in western North America shows intermediate water content (Grant et al. 2007, Li et al. 2008).

Some samples of cratonic and oceanic lithospheric mantle appear to be dry; this finding is consistent with magnetotelluric studies of several cratons and oceanic lithosphere, which reveal thick, highly resistive layers (Eaton et al. 2009, Hirth et al. 2000). However, many Phanerozoic
Figure 11

Water in continental mantle. (a) Bound water in ppm by weight (ppmw) in clinopyroxenes from peridotites of different ages and tectonic environments (Grant et al. 2007, Li et al. 2008, Peslier et al. 2007, Yang et al. 2008). (b) Water in olivine predicted from olivine/clinopyroxene partition coefficients (Aubaud et al. 2008, Tenner et al. 2009). Fields for water in olivine inferred for the mantle source of mid-ocean ridge basalt (MORB) and ocean island basalt (OIB) were calculated using data from Hirschmann (2006) and the above mineral/mineral partition coefficients. (c) Effective viscosity as a function of water content (in ppm by weight) and temperature following procedures in Li et al. (2008) based on modifications of Bai & Kohlstedt (1993) and Mei & Kohlstedt (2000a,b); a background stress state (σ) of 0.3 MPa is assumed. Abbreviations: AP, abyssal peridotite; CPX, clinopyroxene; N, number of measurements; OL, olivine.

Peridotites and cratonic regions that have been influenced by Phanerozoic subduction appear to be “wet.” Whether this “wetness” is a primary (e.g., ancient) feature or whether it represents rehydration of an initially dehydrated layer is debated. The possibility of recent rehydration related to kimberlite genesis must also be considered.

In any case, the inferred variations in olivine water content translate into a contrast in effective viscosity of two orders of magnitude. This effect can be seen in Figure 11c, which shows viscosity as a function of water content in olivine using a non-Newtonian flow law [the calculations follow...
the approach in Li et al. (2008) using modified flow laws and parameterizations from Mei & Kohlstedt (2000a,b) and Bai & Kohlstedt (1993). If continental chemical boundary layers are indeed dehydrated, then continents are also underlain by a compositionally defined rheological boundary layer.

**BUILDING CONTINENTAL MANTLE**

We consider the following statements about continental mantle to be robust:

1. Continents, particularly Archean cratons, are underlain by thick thermal boundary layers chemically isolated from the ambient mantle for long time periods.
2. The age spectra of continental crust and mantle are not uniform.
3. Continental mantle is represented by a chemical boundary layer made up of melt-depleted peridotites, ranging from 30–50% melt extraction beneath Archean cratons to <30% beneath Phanerozoic continents.
4. The integrated compositional buoyancy of continental mantle roughly offsets its negative thermal buoyancy, but perfectly isopycnic conditions are not met.
5. The protoliths of cratonic peridotites melted at pressures shallower than their final equilibration pressures.
6. Low-MgO garnet pyroxenites (and associated diamonds) retain signatures of low-pressure, low-temperature processes.

Cratonic mantle may have also been dehydrated during melt extraction. If so, the chemical boundary layer beneath continents may also coincide with a rheologically strong boundary layer. Viable models of generating thick, buoyant, and strong chemical boundary layers must satisfy all the above characteristics. Successful models should also consider possible relationships between the formation of continental mantle and the formation and differentiation of continental crust.

**Plume Origin**

One mechanism for cratonic mantle formation is via melting within a large thermal plume (Figure 12a) wherein the high temperatures would lead to high degrees of melting.
(Arndt et al. 2009, Griffin & O'Reilly 2007, Griffin et al. 2003, Herzberg 1993). The attraction of this model is that a highly melt-depleted, dehydrated, and low-density chemical boundary layer is an immediate product of plume melting, resulting in the formation of a craton from the outset. In other words, this is an in situ formation event. Mantle-crust differentiation and continent formation coincide in space and time. Modern analogs of generating depleted chemical boundary layers by melting in plume heads may be represented by oceanic plateaus, such as Ontong Java. If Archean plumes represent major mantle upwellings, cratonic mantle formation would be expected to be episodic, consistent with the episodic age distribution of continents. Hot-mantle potential temperatures in the Archean would presumably favor cratonic mantle formation by plumes, but the lack of cratons older than 3.5 Ga would imply that early Archean cratons were destroyed.

Specifically, the plume model predicts a gradual stratification from highly melt-depleted (high \( F \), Mg\#) peridotite at shallow depths to fertile peridotites (low \( F \), Mg\#) at the base of the thermal boundary layer, but such stratification is not a general feature of cratons (Figure 10). This model predicts high-degree melting at a depth of \( \sim 200 \) km, but the 1700\(^\circ\)C temperatures of melting recorded by cratonic peridotites are not high enough to generate extensive melting at these depths. Cratonic peridotites have a subsolidus history of pressure increase, and this cannot be explained by the plume model.

Underthrusting and Imbrication of Oceanic Lithosphere

Another mechanism for building thick continents involves underthrusting or imbrication of oceanic lithosphere (Canil 2004, Canil 2008, Helmstaedt & Schulze 1989, Lee 2006, Pearson & Wittig 2008, Simon et al. 2007). This model (Figure 12b) can explain the low-pressure protoliths of cratonic peridotites, the low-temperature protoliths of low-MgO garnet pyroxenites, the light carbon isotopic signature of eclogitic diamonds, the general lack of systematic compositional stratification with depth, and the presence of subhorizontal and dipping discontinuities within the continental mantle. Partial melting of underthrusting oceanic crust could generate felsic magmas such that formation of evolved continental crust and thick continental mantle would be tectonically linked. Indeed, melting of oceanic crust has been suggested to be an important process in forming the tonalite-trondhjemit-granodiorite suites commonly found in Archean continental crust.

Subtle inconsistencies and questions remain about the model’s physical plausibility. This process is thought to be unlikely because negatively buoyant oceanic lithosphere should subduct instead of subcrete (Arndt et al. 2009). However, several lines of evidence indicate that fragments of the Farallon oceanic plate appear to have been captured beneath western North America during the Cenozoic (Luffi et al. 2009, Saleeby 2003). Although the detailed mechanisms have not been worked out, it is clear that plate capture was related to low-angle subduction, perhaps due to changes in relative plate motions, subduction of young lithosphere, or subduction of a buoyant oceanic plateau (Dickinson & Snyder 1978, Saleeby 2003). Thicker and hence more buoyant oceanic crust was probably more common in the hot Archean, so plate capture may have been more efficient in the Archean.

Buoyancy considerations alone constitute only part of the story. Imbrication of oceanic lithosphere must be accommodated by large-scale weak zones or fault planes. Yet, the longevity of continental lithosphere suggests that continental mantle is inherently strong. For imbrication to be viable, these large-scale weak zones must eventually heal (i.e., strengthen) but survive long enough for sufficient underthrusting to generate a chemical boundary layer that is 200–250 km thick (Cooper et al. 2006). Lee et al. (2008) proposed that the serpentinized tops of oceanic mantle may have served as the weak zones. They suggested that the early Archean mantle was too hot for
serpentinites to form and that the period from the late Proterozoic to the present was too cold for the faults to heal. Instead, they showed that the conditions for craton formation by imbrication were favored in the mid-Archean to the early Proterozoic. Whereas the plume model attributes the lack of early Archean cratons to preferential recycling, the lithosphere-imbrication model attributes it to the unfavorable conditions of craton formation during the early Archean. Finally, another difficulty in the imbrication model is that the predicted amount of eclogite exceeds the present amount in the continents (Schulze 1989); thus some mechanism is needed to remove the eclogites without simultaneously removing their peridotitic counterparts (see below). Alternatively, if the lower crust is weak, it is possible that much of it would not have been underthrust.

**Accretion and Orogenic Thickening of Arcs**

One driver of Phanerozoic continental-crust formation is the formation of basaltic island arcs followed by accretion and maturation into continental arcs ([Figure 12c](#)). Could arc processes have been involved in forming cratons (Kelemen et al. 1998, Parman et al. 2004)? For an arc-origin model to be successful, thickening of arc mantle must occur as discussed above. Young arcs are typically under extension, but as subduction zones mature, arcs often evolve into a compressional state as exemplified by the Cretaceous North American Cordilleran and active Andean continental arcs, wherein arc magmatism coincides with lithospheric thickening (DeCelles et al. 2009, Kay et al. 2005). Some similarities exist between rocks from modern continental arcs and xenoliths from ancient continental lithosphere. For example, the garnet-bearing mafic residues and cumulates generated within the lower crust and mantle of continental arcs (Ducea & Saleeby 1998, Jagoutz et al. 2009, Kay et al. 2005, Lee et al. 2006) are remarkably similar in composition to high-MgO garnet pyroxenites in cratons ([Figure 9](#)). Archean tonalite-trondhjemite-granodiorite series are geochemically similar to calc-alkaline rocks associated with continental arcs (Chamberlain et al. 2003). Finally, spinels from Archean cratonic peridotites have high Cr/(Cr + Al), a feature that seems to be found primarily in arc environments where hydrous fluxing is thought to promote the high-degree melting necessary to generate high Cr/(Cr + Al) (Arai & Ishimaru 2008). [Figure 13](#) compares Cr/(Cr + Al) and Mg/(Mg + Fe2+) of spinels from subarc mantle (Arai & Ishimaru 2008), abyssal peridotites (Dick & Bullen 1984), Cretaceous Sierra Nevada arc lithosphere in California (E.J. Chin, unpublished data), and the Archean Tanzanian craton (Lee & Rudnick 1999). These lithological similarities make the arc hypothesis attractive, but further testing will require integrating geologic field relationships with petrological and geochemical studies of the crust and mantle.

**DESTROYING CONTINENTAL MANTLE**

Although continents appear to be long-lived, many continents may have already been destroyed and recycled, leaving no trace of their prior existence. Geochemical studies of ocean island basalts using radiogenic isotopes as tracers have identified isotopic endmembers that have been interpreted to represent pods of recycled ancient continental mantle in the convecting mantle (Hofmann 1997). More direct evidence comes from using xenoliths, magmas, and geophysics to constrain how the thickness and composition of continental lithosphere change with time. For example, changes in magma geochemistry and Os isotopic composition of lithospheric mantle xenoliths beneath the Archean North China craton suggest Paleoproterozoic lithospheric removal in the north and Phanerozoic lithospheric removal in the east (Gao et al. 2002, Griffin et al. 1998, Menzies et al. 2007, Rudnick et al. 2004). Mesozoic or Tertiary thinning of the Archean Wyoming cratonic mantle has also been suggested on the basis of diamond-bearing kimberlites in the Paleozoic
Figure 13

Atomic Cr/(Cr + Al) versus atomic Mg/(Mg + Fe²⁺) in spinels from Archean Tanzanian cratonic peridotites (Lee & Rudnick 1999) and peridotite xenoliths from beneath the Cretaceous Sierra Nevada batholith in California (E.J. Chin, unpublished data). Fields for subarc mantle and abyssal peridotites are taken from Arai & Ishimaru (2008) and Dick & Bullen (1984).

and the presently thinner, seismically defined root (Carlson & Irving 1994, Egger et al. 1988, Goes & van der Lee 2002). Other examples of the recycling of Proterozoic and Phanerozoic continental mantle include the recent removal of Proterozoic and younger lithosphere that has been suggested for Sierra Nevada, California (Ducea & Saleeby 1996, Saleeby et al. 2003); the Proterozoic Colorado Plateau in the southwestern United States (Li et al. 2008); and the Alboran Sea in the western Mediterranean (Seber et al. 1996). Deep removal of Phanerozoic lithosphere has also been suggested for Tibet and many other orogenic belts. Below, we review models for removal of continental lithosphere (Figure 14). We do not discuss gravitational or active extensional processes as these processes do not return mantle lithosphere into the convecting mantle.

Convective Removal

Any lithospheric removal driven by thermal or chemical buoyancy forces (e.g., density-driven forces) is referred to as convective removal (Figure 14a). In the absence of any compositionally induced stabilizing effects, density contrasts are the inevitable consequence of thermal contrasts, and the degree to which buoyancy forces exceed resisting forces (e.g., friction) defines the rate and nature of convective removal. Both vertical and lateral temperature contrasts are capable of driving small-scale convective instabilities, promoting lithospheric erosion from below (growth of Rayleigh–Taylor instabilities; see Huang et al. 2003 and Korenaga & Jordan 2003) and from the sides (edge-driven convection; see King 2005). Such processes may be operating on the edges of the Colorado Plateau and Wyoming and Tanzanian cratons, all of which are surrounded by incipient rifts. Larger-scale instabilities can occur if there is a large overstep in buoyancy forces, such as when a thermal boundary layer is rapidly thickened (compared with thermal relaxation times) during continent-continent collisions (Conrad & Molnar 1997, Houseman & Molnar 1997, Molnar et al. 1998). Such scenarios may result in well-defined convective downwellings, which not
Different models for destroying or recycling continental mantle. (a) Convective removal, whereby removal is driven by buoyancy forces (thermal or chemical). These processes include delamination, foundering, Rayleigh-Taylor instabilities, and edge-driven convection. (b) Basal traction, whereby basal shear stresses drive deformation. This traction is related to the presence of a thinner low-viscosity zone ($L\eta Z$) beneath continents. The dashed line represents the base of the low-viscosity zone. (c) Removal facilitated by rheological weakening, whereby the rheology of the cratonic mantle is decreased, making it easier for convective or traction-driven removal of lithosphere. (d) Thermomagmatic removal, a variant of convective removal. In this mechanism, melts generated below the continental mantle intrude into the continent, increasing its density and temperature, thereby expediting convective removal. This process is suppressed beneath continents with thick roots because the head space for decompression partial melting is substantially reduced. (e) Viscous drainage, wherein low-viscosity pyroxenites slide out along an inclined plane over long geologic time periods. Blue arrows represent hydrous fluids derived from a subducted oceanic plate. Black- and red-arrowed circles represent small-scale convection; red-arrowed circles represent convective systems that occur at depths shallower than the solidus and therefore generate partial melts. $\tau$, shear stress.

Basal Traction

Erosion of continental lithosphere can be driven by basal shear stresses imposed by mantle flow in the asthenosphere (Figure 14b). Basal shear stress should increase as asthenosphere thickness decreases. If the bottom of the asthenosphere is defined globally at a relatively constant depth, then asthenosphere thickness should vary inversely with lithosphere thickness. This process has been proposed as a mechanism of limiting craton thickness (Cooper & Conrad 2009), but complete destruction of cratons is unlikely because the shear stresses decrease rapidly as craton thickness decreases.

Rheological Weakening

Weakening the rheology of continental mantle can facilitate convective removal (Figure 14c). One way to weaken continental mantle is to rehydrate it, perhaps via the infiltration of hydrous fluids.
melts or supercritical fluids released from a subducting slab. Both the North China craton and western North America were once underlain by a subducting slab. In western North America, there is growing evidence that much of the lithosphere was modified by hydrous fluids from the “flat”-subducting Farallon plate (Humphreys et al. 2003, Lee 2005, Li et al. 2008, Rowe & Lassiter 2009, Smith 2010) and that this may have weakened the North American lithosphere (Li et al. 2008). Carbonatite metasomatism, which is common in cratonic environments, may also transport water into continental mantle (Dasgupta et al. 2007).

Thermomagmatic Erosion
Refertilization (in a major-element sense) via diking or porous flow, as suggested by Foley (2008), may be another mechanism of destabilizing continental mantle (Figure 14d) because of the resulting increases in Fe content, water content, and temperature, the latter due to advection of heat (short-term response) and increased heat production (long-term response). The increases in Fe and water content lead to compositional densification and a decrease in viscosity, promoting convective removal. However, refertilization is effective only if sufficient amounts of silicate melts are generated (low-degree melts, such as carbonatites, are too minor to lead to any fundamental changes in major-element composition). Both plume impingement and small-scale convective instabilities are favorable environments for generating melts, provided that the mantle solidus is crossed during decompression, but adequate head space for decompression above the solidus is required for melting. Thermomagmatic erosion should thus be more efficient beneath thin continents than beneath thick continents, where it may not operate at all unless thermal plumes or anomalous radiogenic heat production locally raise potential temperature. We speculate that this could explain why thick Archean cratons are relatively undisturbed, whereas thinner Phanerozoic and Proterozoic continents show more evidence for convective thinning. If so, the fate of continents may in part be related to their initial thicknesses.

Viscous Drainage
We suggest that inclined layers of garnet pyroxenite could “drain” back into the convecting mantle owing to their high densities and low viscosities compared with peridotite (Figure 14e). Drain rates could range from a few tens to hundreds of millions of years; the rates would correlate positively with density contrast, dip angle, and the square of pyroxenite layer thickness and inversely with viscosity of the pyroxenite. This scenario, albeit untested, provides a mechanism for removing garnet pyroxenites from the continental mantle without disturbing the peridotite framework of the continent.

FUTURE DIRECTIONS
Numerous outstanding questions are not addressed here. What is the petrogenetic connection between continental crust and continental mantle? How do continental boundary layers influence global convection and heat loss from Earth? What role do thick chemical boundary layers play in modulating timescales of supercontinent breakup and assembly? How do continents modulate the nature and style of intraplate magmatism? To what extent do magmas derive from the deep continental lithosphere? Are continental boundary layers significant trace-element reservoirs? Could they be important source rocks for certain types of ore deposits? What processes control the rise and fall of elevation for presumably stable continental interiors? What is the role of erosion in continental evolution? How does asthenosphere thickness vary beneath continents?
Finally, to what extent do continent formation and destruction influence long-term climate change? Answering these questions will inevitably require synthesis of many disparate data sets, ranging from petrology to geophysics and beyond.

**DISCLOSURE STATEMENT**

The authors are not aware of any affiliations, memberships, funding, or financial holdings that might be perceived as affecting the objectivity of this review.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

Discussions with N. Arndt, M. Barth, M. Bostock, G. Brimhall, Jr., R. Carlson, D. Canil, R. Dasgupta, M. Duca, D. Eaton, G. Hirth, D. Ionov, M. Kopylova, A. Lenardic, A. Levander, S. Z.-X. Li, S.J. Mackwell, W. McDonough, F. Niu, S. Parman, G. Pearson, A. Peslier, S. Shirey, and R. Walker over the years are appreciated. We especially thank R. Rudnick, V. Le Roux, and T. Höink for discussions. This work was supported by the Packard Foundation and U.S. NSF grants to C.-T.A.L. (EAR-0309121, -0549268, -0365338, -0745540).

**LITERATURE CITED**


Bostock M. 1999. Seismic imaging of lithospheric discontinuities and continental evolution. Lithos 48:1–16


Condie KC. 2005. TTGs and adakites: are they both slab melts? *Lithos* 80:33–44


Contents

Plate Tectonics, the Wilson Cycle, and Mantle Plumes: Geodynamics from the Top

Kevin Burke ................................................................. 1

Early Silicate Earth Differentiation

Guillaume Caro ............................................................ 31

Building and Destroying Continental Mantle

Cin-Ty A. Lee, Peter Laffi, and Emily J. Chin .................................. 59

Deep Mantle Seismic Modeling and Imaging

Thorne Lay and Edward J. Garnero ........................................ 91

Using Time-of-Flight Secondary Ion Mass Spectrometry to Study Biomarkers

Volker Thiel and Peter Sjövall .................................................. 125

Hydrogeology and Mechanics of Subduction Zone Forearcs: Fluid Flow and Pore Pressure

Demian M. Saffer and Harold J. Tobin .................................... 157

Soft Tissue Preservation in Terrestrial Mesozoic Vertebrates

Mary Higby Schweitzer ..................................................... 187

The Multiple Origins of Complex Multicellularity

Andrew H. Knoll .................................................................. 217

Paleoecologic Megatrends in Marine Metazoa

Andrew M. Bush and Richard K. Bambach .................................. 241

Slow Earthquakes and Nonvolcanic Tremor

Gregory C. Beroza and Satoshi Ide .......................................... 271

Archean Microbial Mat Communities

Michael M. Tice, Daniel C.O. Thornton, Michael C. Pope,
Thomas D. Olszewski, and Jian Gong ....................................... 297

Uranium Series Accessory Crystal Dating of Magmatic Processes

Axel K. Schmitt .................................................................... 321
A Perspective from Extinct Radionuclides on a Young Stellar Object: The Sun and Its Accretion Disk
Nicolas Dauphas and Marc Chaussidon ......................................................... 351

Learning to Read the Chemistry of Regolith to Understand the Critical Zone
Susan L. Brantley and Marina Lebedeva ......................................................... 387

Climate of the Neoproterozoic
R.T. Pierrehumbert, D.S. Abbot, A. Voigt, and D. Koll ........................................ 417

Optically Stimulated Luminescence Dating of Sediments over the Past 200,000 Years
Edward J. Rhodes .......................................................................................... 461

The Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum: A Perturbation of Carbon Cycle, Climate, and Biosphere with Implications for the Future
Francesca A. McInerney and Scott L. Wing ....................................................... 489

Evolution of Grasses and Grassland Ecosystems
Caroline A.E. Strömberg .................................................................................. 517

Rates and Mechanisms of Mineral Carbonation in Peridotite: Natural Processes and Recipes for Enhanced, in situ CO₂ Capture and Storage
Peter B. Kelemen, Juerg Matter, Elisabeth E. Streit, John F. Rudge, William B. Curry, and Jerzy Blusztajn ......................................................... 545

Ice Age Earth Rotation
Jerry X. Mitrovica and John Wahr ........................................................................ 577

Biogeochemistry of Microbial Coal-Bed Methane
Dariusz Strapoć, Maria Mastalerz, Katherine Dawson, Jennifer Macalady, Amy V. Callaghan, Boris Wawrik, Courtney Turich, and Matthew Ashby ......................................................... 617

Indexes
Cumulative Index of Contributing Authors, Volumes 29–39 ........................................ 657
Cumulative Index of Chapter Titles, Volumes 29–39 .................................................. 661

Errata
An online log of corrections to *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences* articles may be found at http://earth.annualreviews.org